

**COMMUNITY BOARD 9
890 NOSTRAND AVENUE
BROOKLYN, NY 11225**

**MINUTES OF THE COMMUNITY BOARD MEETING
HELD ON MARCH 24, 2015
MEDGAR EVERS COLLEGE FOUNDERS AUDITORIUM
1650 BEDFORD AVENUE, BROOKLYN, 11225**

Members Present

Stuart Balberg
Fred Baptiste
Simone Bennett
Warren Berke
Augustine Blackwell
Veta May Clarke
Josette Coicou-Brioche
Ben Edwards
Shelia Foster Golding
Rabbi Jacob Goldstein
Rabbi Nochum Gross
Tessa Hackett-Vieira
Sylveta Hamilton-Gonzales
Aron Hershkop
Laura Imperiale
Louis Johnson
Demetrius Johnson

Members Present

Avi Leshes
Michael Liburd
Carmen Martinez
Musa Moore
Patricia Moses
Beverly Newsome
Frank Nicholas
Gerald President
Unella Rhone-Perry
Mary Rollerson-Blackett
Brenda Scott
Chanina Sperlin
Rabbi Joseph Spielman
Ada Terry
Timothy Thomas
Jacqueline Welch
Evelyn Williams

Members Absent

Patricia Baker
Rev. Douglas Banks
Rev. Phyllis Brown
Michael Cetera, AIA
Milton Ellis
Daniel Ingvaldstad
Denise Mann
Pia Raymond
Diana Richardson
Roosevelt Rose
Kenya Sollas
Yvonne Straker

Elected Officials/Agency Representatives Present

Brian McLaurin – Hon. Letitia James
Dale DeGale – Hon. Yvette Clarke
Jamel Pollard – Hon. Eric Adams
James Boyd – Agency for Children’s Services
Karen Chambers – Hon. Kenneth P. Thompson
Soumia Chiribi – Hon. Mathieu Eugene

Reuven Lipkind – Hon. Jesse Hamilton
Daphnee Champagne – Kings County Hospital
William Boone – Medgar Evers College
Arna Lipkind – Hon. Darlene Mealy
Ramona Cabieja - Hon. Mathieu Eugene

(Spokesman for the Flatbush Trees Project) After the 2 years in which the slate was voted in by the community, we have updates regarding the Flatbush Trees Project. At Flatbush and Ocean Aves., there is a monument without a name or artist’s identity. As an artist, that is my body of work. I had a few ideas and pitched this to CB9. It involves students from public schools. The target school, Jackie Robinson school, consisted of the 3rd, 4th, and 5th grades. Working with 100 students over 6 months, we have accomplished much, and they are to be commended. For example, they had a 7-color packet. If desired, the artist can replace the colors. We worked from a model from which the artists adapted, so they could say, “That is my work”. Here are examples. I wanted to involve children because, to me, they are the neighborhood’s priority. An additional purpose was to aid in advocating for arts in the public schools. Art classes helped me. My role was minimal. The cutting up of thousands of templates and inserting them into the teams’ packets, transporting them to the school, and working 3 hours with each class throughout the 6 months. There is still considerably more work to be done, so we want to expand the project to the community at large. Beginning May 18, I shall apply (from the tree model) sections of the art onto the trees. One student was very inquisitive

about the neighborhood, and quite brilliant. Another spoke only Spanish. Here is a slow-motion view of the project. With permission of the MTA, there shall be 2 models. I rented 4 tables. Thank you for the honor of allowing me to speak. (Response to a question about the durability of the materials) The material is durable for 6 years and can survive a car wash, but I intended this to be merely a jump-start. Other artists have offered to join in. I agreed, but I expect the material to last for just 2 years, and by then, other artists will continue the efforts. But the material will probably last for 10 years and I do not wish to usurp public funds.

(Rudy Delson representing the Parkside Plaza Project) I am here to report on our objectives and progress. Shown here is the triangle of land outside the Parkside and Ocean subway station. There was a design contest and the winner did the design work. We contacted the NYC Dept. of Transportation's Public Plaza program, and they agreed to view the project. We are using granite work, benches, and plantings. The city will provide the materials and the local community will maintain it. It was approved 4 years ago, and we expect it to be finished in July. First, we constructed some tree bits. The Parks Dept. did the planting, and some of our neighbors put up tree guards. Then, benches were installed. This is the first time that there have been trees on that site. Last November, we held an event in which we introduced some tables and chairs, and a children's library. We intend to bring in arts groups and have musical performances. We now want your participation. The subway tracks run underneath, so we cannot use certain materials. So we had to restructure the project. Because of budget restraints, we scaled down, somewhat, the scope. We will have slightly fewer plants than originally planned, but the tables and chairs will remain. This will serve as a gateway to the park. Thanks to Councilman Mathieu Eugene, the Parkside merchants' Association, and CB 9. The ribbon cutting is scheduled for May 2. You may email us at Playkidsstore@gmail.com.

Questions / Answers: Q) Did you have to schedule the Grand opening on a Saturday, the Jewish Sabbath? A) If it is more convenient, we can hold it on the next day, Sunday. (Board chair) Then you will reschedule it for Sunday, May 3? A) OK.

ZONING TEXT AMENDMENT DOCUMENT ISSUE

(Chair) This issue was discussed at the Executive Board meeting. We received the 22-page document from the Mayor and placed it on our website, and have referred it to the next ULURP committee meeting for deliberation. It proposes to drastically change the zoning process. Some community boards are already rallying against this. It is important that we as a board make a decision on the proposal. We open the floor to comments.

(Lisa) We all knew about it but CB9 and Pearl Miles did nothing to actively disseminate the document. Pearl didn't do her job. Also, this amendment would change the requirements for Senior housing. Refer to the section marked "Certification requirements". You might need handrails to build a Senior house. In the list of requirements, they fail to specify which, if any, requirements will be eliminated. That's a problem. It also proposes to allow 5- to 15-foot taller buildings in the community, and it completely will remove parking regulations for Senior buildings. They label it as "affordability" but do not define it in a local context, so that in our building, there would be no real affordability. Finally, they fail to define the percentage of Senior use that qualify such a building as a Senior building.

(Chair) So, this is a serious issue and the Mayor's office should explain this to us. I request that the ULURP chair and the District Manager contact City Hall for an explanation. There is not enough communication among the neighborhoods on the matter.

DRAFT FOR THE NYC DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING REQUEST

(Chair) This draft, voted on at our last meeting, is under challenge. It was brought out at the Executive Board meeting that the vote to ratify was taken after the meeting was formally adjourned. So, it was decided to bring it back to the ULURP committee to resolve confusion over the vote. I am asking ULURP chair Ben Edwards to review this before Passover because of time constraints. The deadline for comments will be April 6.

(Tim Thomas) We have to take into account the religious holidays.

(Pearl Miles) There was one Jewish member on the committee. That has nothing to do with religious differences. We are a public body and want to accommodate everyone. We have a very large Jewish community that wants to attend meetings, and if that conflicts with the scheduled meeting dates, we cannot hold meetings on their religious holidays when they are not allowed to attend.

(Chair) And even those Jewish residents who are not on the committee have a right to be accommodated. This is a sweeping resolution and needs to be addressed quickly.

(Q.) Can you give me a list of Jewish and non-Jewish ULURP committee members?

(A.) I do not have an official list. I will ask Pearl Miles to address that. Also, it has been raised that members of the community want to serve on the committees. We are in receipt of 35 applications to join the ULURP, Housing, and Transportation committees. It is important that the appointments be made quickly, before the next meeting. So, the appointment criteria have not been determined, and we did not get a chance to meet with those committees. Committee membership status means that you get to vote at the committee, not at the General Board meetings. You may also participate at committee meetings even if you are not an appointed member. We will determine before the next ULURP meeting, who is, and who is not, a committee member. There are 2 items to be resolved, the Zoning Text Amendment and the Department of City Planning request. We shall post the Zoning Text Amendment.

(Rabbi Jacob Goldstein) I was Chairman here for 34 years. I just heard a question. In our country, we do not single out people for the faith or color, so the question, "How many Jews?", is a loaded question. I am not often upset, but now, I am. I wore the uniform and am proud of it, and one of the things for which our Country stands is that we respect each person's faith and skin color equally. So the answer to such a question should never be compiled or posted.

(Q) I was the one who asked the question, and that's because the meeting is not just for 1 or 2 individuals, or for 1 or 2 groups. I am not biased. If it is so important that the item has to be answered quickly, why should it be dictated around one set agenda? That was my purpose for asking that question. Are we working for 1 set of religion or 1 set of rules? If this is so important and it goes by the majority, you will have a majority of members there to make the expedient decision and not have to delay it just for 1 group. If you put it in the wrong way, I apologize.

(Suki) (inaudible)

(A.) It is a complex issue and in your suggested 2-hour discussion there will be no way to address all the comments. There needs to be a second meeting. I will deal with this. However, the DCP letter was dealt with at the ULURP meeting, so all we need is a second vote. They are returning the letter to the committee and this is what the issue is. When we are in executive session, the Board can vote. It was over a technicality.

(Alicia) (inaudible)

(Chair) We will try to accommodate. We will discuss the issue with the Chairman of the Committee, and also the agenda.

(Liz Mackin) Let us call Ben Edwards to discuss the draft.

(Mr. Edwards read into the record the text of the Draft letter, attached) We will take comments.

- This is a crazy time to request this from DCP with housing so unaffordable. The Mayor will not help us. Last year he promised the NY Real Estate Board to improve 15 neighborhoods, with affordable housing. Only 2 neighborhoods have signed on; Bronx and East New York. This study began under Mayor Bloomberg. Ask the neighborhoods why they did not sign on. Also, why the promise to the Real estate Board? Now we can see that "contextual housing" and "height limit" definitions are up in the air. DCP told CB9 about this last month. Why didn't ULURP tell us about it? We know you knew about it, because Senior Housing is discussed in the draft. Did no one feel that the rest was relevant to us? It would allow an additional 1 to 4 stories, to reduce the cost of building to developers, yet we keep hearing, "trust DCP and they'll listen to us". This request is even more vague than the previous one. It does not match up to those in Boerum Hill's preservation R6-b zoning, which should have been done.

- Don't appoint CB9 member Tim Thomas. He insults people, including board members with his ethnically divisive behavior and abusive language on the following dates...

-Remove Empire Boulevard from the study. The Board happens to agree with us on this issue. At Borough President Adams' August 15 town hall meeting, he said he'd remove Empire Boulevard, yet at the board meeting, we brought petitions and they ignored us.

-My observations were that according to Tim Thomas, they had a vote to approve the resolution but the vote was flawed because of improper committee placements. Members were told that there would be no vote taken, but at the end, there was an attempt to have a vote. The committee objected to this, so Chair Ben Edwards called the meeting adjourned. They then met. So, Demetrius Lawrence's statement that the meeting was not adjourned was invalid. So the ensuing meeting was unlawful. And, if you were recorded as voting "no", but you voted "yes", you have to object to your vote. Your silence is consent, and if this was violated, you can be brought up on charges of conspiracy to defraud a vote. The violator, Mr. Thomas, can be brought up on these charges. I forwarded the tape to the DA.

-Laura Imperiale's interim Chair appointment of less than the 2-year term, is a conflict of interest. She works for a multimillion-dollar Queens company, Tully construction. Her clients are NYC agencies such as Parks and transportation. They had a massive project at 59th Street, Manhattan, with the same lobbying that is being done on empire Boulevard. She should neither be a Chair, nor vote. Her plans to select committee members are an example of this conflict of interest. Board member Michael Cetera was an architect of the \$45-million-dollar project. Eric Adams should have known about this conflict of interest. Also, remove Pearl Miles for conducting a meeting about which no one had advance knowledge.

- (Demetrius Lawrence) (chairperson) Nicholson wasn't there, so I had the powers of the Chair because of the vacancy.

-Eric Adams filled seats on the Board that were supposed to be reserved for the City Councilpersons. Thus, you have 18 new members in a bloc that vote together. They were not jointly approved by the Councilpersons, but rather, Adams took the initiative on his own to make the appointments, and he subsequently tampered with records to hide this.

-as to the MTOPP-sponsored debate for candidates in the special Assembly election: Joyce Stewart of that organization spoke to (candidate) Shirley Patterson explaining what we planned to do. She said she would participate. On the next day, she stated that she had a speaking engagement and turned the offer down. Ms. Stewart spoke to (candidate) Diana Richardson, who initially said yes, but then called to say that because of the moderator, she couldn't attend, because she didn't like the moderator. I spoke to (candidate) Mendy Raitport, who said that because of the upcoming Passover holiday, he was concerned about his business, and that this would be his main priority, though he'd try to come. Therefore, Geoffrey Davis was the only candidate who agreed to appear.

(Chair) No campaigning is allowed here.

-At the Eric Adams Town Hall meeting, I resolved to oppose towers in the community, and now am in a struggle to uncover what is happening by our so-called protectors. So, let's shut down the Board if it doesn't represent our interests. Dismantle it, investigate it, and Eric Adams, also for rezoning 18 lots here, without our consent, and he told executive members how to silence the people. The NYPD is used against us and our rights.

-Protesters have been silenced. What are CB9 members thinking and what is there research?

-Why is there no answer to questions before going to DCP? What is the justification for upzoning, when any request for downzoning is not addressed? What exactly is the "context" in the zoning? Why did ULURP not meet with the housing committee?

ADDRESS FROM APPLE HOUSING DOT ORG.

Tyler McDonald of that organization spoke on how they train persons for emergency preparedness. They conduct the training in Kings Plaza.

ADDITIONAL COMMENTS

Reuven Lipkind, representing State Senator Jesse Hamilton: We Shall be giving out Women of Excellence Awards, so make your nominations. Also, we will have an event to issue smoke detector alarms.

Pat Jackson, representing Carroll St. Block Association, We put people in power, so we can put them out.

Lincoln Road resident, proceeding with the DCP plan is a disaster because of its complications. The children will not be able to live in the neighborhood because of the rent prices.

BUSINESSE SESSION

Roll call: 34 present.

District manager Pearl Miles: I was in court on the 26th. I worked with the Sanitation Department about alleyway garages. Severe winter weather impacted on our garbage collection in the alleys. We resolved to meet again about this. Potholes: I contacted DOT to report it. It takes a week to fix. Also, resurfacing will be done on Albany Balfour, Empire, Lefferts, Rutland, Winthrop, Bedford, Rochester, and on the Carroll Street Medgar Evers block. National Grid has to first resurface it. The NYC Office of sustainability NYC 2030 public meetings were held about the need for parks. So far, there has been no increase, and the mayor will address this. Ebbets Field Middle School had a dinner for those with good attendance. Upcoming are a Dept. of Sanitation safe disposal event, a meeting of transportation Alternatives, a meeting of the Historic Districts Council, Councilman Cornegy's Small Business Panel, and a Mayor-sponsored Pre-K Forum at Medgar Evers

College. The organization, Crystal Home, helps children with legal problems, across the street from the Bedford Ave. Medgar Evers College campus.

COMMITTEE REPORT SUMMATIONS

Bylaws – will be deliberated on in 3 sections. This is because of the volume of comments. We completed the first section, but the second is more substantive. Each section needs comment and review, and then the corrections to the final draft. We hope to have them finished in September.

(Chair) And we will post the proposals.

Also, Warren Burke congratulates Rudy that the private sector is supporting the Parkside plaza project.

Economic development – We are readying for a July workshop.

VACANCIES ON EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

(Chair) There are vacancies for Chairperson and Board Secretary. We will establish a nominating committee to conduct the election. 5 to 7 members should volunteer to be the nominating committee. As per by-laws, in April, there is a nominating committee for the entire executive committee. The full election will take place in June. (Fred read articles 6.2 and 7.2 of the bylaws which mandate separate nominations for vacancies and for the entire Executive board.)

(Rabbi Goldstein) For expedience, let's set aside that part of the by-laws that call for the vacant seats to be summarily replaced, and instead, have them remain on the board until the June elections.

(Fred) While it makes little sense to hold 2 elections back to back, the bylaws mandate this, and we should not suspend the by-laws.

A nominating committee was then appointed. Meeting adjourned at approximately 10:20 pm

Respectfully submitted,
Stuart Balberg
Secretary
September 21, 2015

**Community Board 9
890 Nostrand Avenue
Brooklyn, NY 11225**

**Draft Letter to NYC Department of City Planning
Approved by the members of the ULURP Committee
on Monday, March 16, 2015
For Presentation to the Members of
Community Board 9 at the
March 24, 2015 Community Board Meeting**

Dear DCP

On behalf of the residents of Community District 9, Community Board 9 is requesting that the Department of City Planning immediately begin a study of the following geographic area:

- South side of Eastern parkway to the north side of Clarkson Avenue
- East side of New York Avenue to the West side of Flatbush Avenue/Ocean Avenue
- Crown and Carroll Streets from new York to Kingston Avenues

Preserving the existing character of the neighborhood by ensuring all new buildings are kept within specific height limits (including bulkheads,) and that they are contextual. Allowing a modest incremental expansion of the homes on Crown and Carroll Streets, contextually with the surrounding homes.

The study must take into consideration the need for improved service delivery to the community. With special considerations given to improved transportation, sanitation, water delivery and sewer disposal, parking, expansion of open spaces to meet the needs of our large underserved youth population; improved/expanded school buildings to correct the severe lack of gymnasiums, computer rooms, music rooms, libraries that is needed for our children. To this end we are requesting a thorough environmental impact study.

Consider the density of the area when proposing additional housing. We are requesting a set aside of 50% of all affordable housing units (at location) for low income residents, 30% for moderate, and 20% for higher income residents, to enable them to remain in their neighborhood. Senior citizen housing should be a priority.

Consideration should be given to the best use of the commercial corridors and this should be done in collaboration with the community.

Ensure that recommendations submitted by community sponsored planners (within a reasonable time) are considered as part of the process.

We at Community Board 9 are confident that we could collaboratively work together with the Department of City Planning to successfully achieve what's in the best interest of the community. This can be accomplished with discussion and dialogue with the community input throughout the process making it a truly cooperative experience.

Respectfully yours